|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Journal Name: | **[Journal of Global Ecology and Environment](https://www.ikprress.org/index.php/JOGEE)** |
| Manuscript Number: | **Ms\_JOGEE\_13144** |
| Title of the Manuscript: | **Characterizing Spatio-temporal Dynamics of Land Use and Land Cover in Urban Environment of Chhatrapati Sambhajinagar.** |
| Type of the Article |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 1: Comments** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment**  **Artificial Intelligence (AI) generated or assisted review comments are strictly prohibited during peer review.** | **Author’s Feedback** (It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| **Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.** | The manuscript is important for LULC classification and change dynamics. It is highly useful to policy makers for future planning.  Authors have implemented only one method,the manuscript needs significant improvement. | Thank you for suggestions, authors would like to state that, based on the data availability and its application the best and scientifically authentic method has been selected for the analysis. |
| **Is the title of the article suitable?**  **(If not please suggest an alternative title)** | The title can be modified | Authors would like to go with the original title |
| **Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.** | Abstract is written in a comprehensive way. | yes |
| **Is the manuscript scientifically correct? Please write here.** | The manuscript utilizes satellite imagery and implements the Maximum likelihood method. The other methods can be explored to enhance the results. | Yes certainly, as the scope of the manuscript have been kept limited to minimize the chances of errors. |
| **Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.** | Some recent work must be studied. For example.  1.[Assessment of land use-land cover dynamics and its future projection through Google Earth Engine, machine learning and QGIS-MOLUSCE: A case study in Jagatsinghpur district, Odisha, India | Journal of Earth System Science](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s12040-024-02305-3)  2.Kaur H, Tyagi S and Mehta M 2023 Time series (2001/2002–2021) analysis of Earth observation data using Google Earth Engine (GEE) for detecting changes in land use land cover (LULC) with specific reference to forest cover in East Godavari Region, Andhra Pradesh, India; *J. Earth Syst. Sci.* 132 86. | Thank you for suggestion. |
| **Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?** | No. It needs significant improvement | Thank you |
| **Optional/General** comments | 1. Authors have shown the change dynamics of two years 2011 and 2023. The study should provide future projection (for ex. 2030,2040) so that it can help policy makers in advance planning.  2. Authors should validate the results with ESA world cover maps or ESRI Landcover maps.  3.In the block diagram the authors mentioned training sample selection. However the strategy used for sample selection is not at all mentioned in the manuscript. The number of samples per class are also not mentioned.  4. Authors should explore minimum 4-5 algorithms and then compare the results. Instead of just showing the results of one algorithm.  5. No where mathematical formulas are mentioned for performance evaluation measures.  6. Authors have not shown limitations of existing systems which has motivated authors to conduct the study  7. There is a repeation of statements in the Introduction section and Study area section.  8. All table headings are mentioned below the table. Authors should check it properly  9. Authors have not mentioned the proposed method clearly  10. Formatting is not proper  11. The results mentioned in the table are again explained. It is not at all requited  12. At many places link in different sections is missing |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PART 2:** | | |
|  | **Reviewer’s comment** | **Author’s Feedback** (It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| **Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?** | *(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in detail)*  - |  |