

Journal Name:	<u>Journal of Global Research in Education and Social Science</u>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JOGRESS_12741
Title of the Manuscript:	Quality of Residential Environmental Comfort in the Historical Area of Kampung Melayu with a Morphological Typology Approach (Case Study: Kampung Peranakan, kampung Banjar and Kampung Kalicilik, Semarang, Indonesia)
Type of the Article	

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	This manuscript contributes valuable insights into the relationship between urban morphology and residential environmental comfort in historical settlements. By examining Kampung Melayu in Semarang, Indonesia, using a morphological typology approach, it provides a comprehensive analysis of how traditional architectural layouts and spatial configurations influence livability. The findings can guide urban planners, architects, and policymakers in developing sustainable revitalization strategies that preserve cultural heritage while enhancing quality of life. Additionally, this research bridges gaps in existing literature on historical urban	

	<p>environments in Southeast Asia, fostering a deeper understanding of context-sensitive urban development.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The title you provided is clear and descriptive, but it is quite long and could be refined to make it more concise and engaging for a journal audience. Here is a modified version that improves readability while retaining the key elements of your study:</p> <p>"Assessing Residential Environmental Comfort in Kampung Melayu's Historical Area Using a Morphological Typology Approach: Case Studies of Kampung Peranakan, Kampung Banjar, and Kampung Kalicilik, Semarang, Indonesia"</p> <p>Explanation of the Changes:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Simplified structure: "Assessing" replaces "Quality of" to imply an analytical approach, making the study's purpose more dynamic. 2. Clarified focus: The phrase "Residential Environmental Comfort" is kept to retain the core subject. 3. Shortened location references: "Kampung Melayu's Historical Area" flows better than a longer construction. 4. Streamlined case studies: Listing the case study areas without redundant repetition improves clarity. 	

<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract is detailed and provides a clear summary of the study's objectives, methods, findings, and implications. However, there are some areas where clarity and focus can be improved. Here are specific suggestions for enhancing the abstract:</p> <p>Suggestions for Improvement:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Clarify the purpose and significance: Add a brief statement at the beginning explaining <i>why</i> examining residential environmental comfort in historical areas is important. This will highlight the broader relevance of the study. Example: <i>"Understanding residential environmental comfort in historical urban areas is critical for balancing cultural preservation with sustainable living conditions."</i>2. Simplify and strengthen the results section: The explanation of results is informative but slightly wordy. Streamlining the description will improve readability while maintaining the key points. Example: <i>"The study found that all three locations exceeded the standard comfort thresholds, with Jalan Kampung Kalicilik showing the lowest comfort due to dense building layouts and narrow roads, while Kampung Peranakan and Kampung Banjar had better conditions due to linear layouts."</i>3. Focus on key environmental metrics: Temperature, humidity, and noise levels are well described, but consider emphasizing their connection to morphological differences more directly. Example: <i>"Temperature levels exceeded 18–30°C, and noise levels surpassed 55 dB near high-activity zones, reflecting the influence of urban morphology on environmental comfort."</i>4. State implications more explicitly:	
---	--	--

	<p>The conclusion could explicitly tie the findings to actionable recommendations or future research. Example: <i>"These findings underscore the need for morphology-sensitive urban planning strategies that enhance comfort while preserving the cultural heritage of historic settlements."</i></p> <p>Suggested Revised Abstract (Incorporating Changes):</p> <p>"This study investigates residential environmental comfort in the historical area of Kampung Melayu, Semarang, Indonesia, focusing on Jalan Kampung Peranakan, Jalan Kampung Banjar, and Jalan Kampung Kalicilik. Using a descriptive qualitative approach, the research explores the impact of air temperature, humidity, noise levels, and morphological typology on residential comfort. Data were gathered through field observations and purposive sampling to assess physical and social dynamics affecting livability. The findings reveal that environmental comfort generally exceeded standard thresholds, with Jalan Kampung Kalicilik exhibiting lower comfort due to dense building layouts and narrow streets. In contrast, the linear layouts of Kampung Peranakan and Kampung Banjar provided conditions closer to comfort standards. Temperature levels consistently surpassed 30°C, while noise levels near main roads often exceeded 55 dB. These results highlight the significant role of urban morphology and spatial planning in shaping residential comfort, providing valuable insights for sustainable development and cultural preservation in historic urban environments."</p>	
<p>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional</p>	<p>Yes</p>	

references, please mention them in the review form.		
Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Yes	
Optional/General comments	The article is very good	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Belay Sitotaw Goshu
Department, University & Country	Dire Dawa University, Ethiopia