

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Basic and Applied Research international</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JOBARI_12700
Title of the Manuscript:	Combining Supervised and Semi-Supervised Models to Enhance Personalized Education
Type of the Article	Short communication

**PART 1: Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)		

<p><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b></p>		
<p><b>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</b></p>		
<p><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b></p>		

<p><b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>		
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>Here are the revisions in a more concise format:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Clarify the Role of Semi-Supervised Learning</b> Explain how semi-supervised learning (GNN) uses unlabeled data to complement supervised learning (Random Forest) and how each method contributes to the overall performance.</li> <li>2. <b>Expand on the Dataset Description</b> Provide more details on the dataset, such as specific features used, how student performance and engagement are measured, and how issues like data imbalances or missing values are handled.</li> <li>3. <b>Include a Discussion of Limitations</b> Address limitations like performance with noisy or incomplete data, scalability for larger datasets, and how the approach might vary across different educational institutions.</li> <li>4. <b>Clarify Hybrid Model Evaluation</b> Include more performance metrics (e.g., precision, recall, F1-score) and a direct comparison of the hybrid model with baseline models in a table to clarify improvements.</li> <li>5. <b>Incorporate Visualizations and Charts</b> Add charts comparing the accuracy, precision, and recall of the models (GNN + RF vs. baseline RF) to make the results more digestible.</li> <li>6. <b>Provide More Detail on GNN Architecture</b> Explain why a two-layer GNN was chosen and discuss hyperparameter tuning, such as learning rates and layer sizes.</li> <li>7. <b>Ethical Considerations of Data Usage</b> Discuss how student privacy is maintained, potential data biases, and the ethical implications of using</li> </ol>	

	<p>machine learning in education.</p> <p>8. <b>Examine Potential Real-World Applications</b> Provide examples of how this model could be implemented in real-world educational settings and its impact on teachers and students.</p> <p>9. <b>Future Work and Improvements</b> Expand on how real-time data can be integrated, potential applications in adaptive learning, and other techniques (e.g., deep learning) that could improve the framework.</p> <p>These revisions will add clarity and depth to the paper, offering a more comprehensive understanding of the approach and its potential.</p>	
--	---	--

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Sobia Wassan</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Nanjing University, China</b>